

The Job Market Package

Duarte Gonçalves

UCL

EEA/ESEM

Barcelona School of Economics

1 September 2023

Introductions

Duarte Gonçalves (duarte.goncalves@ucl.ac.uk; <https://duartegoncalves.com>)

Assistant Professor, Department of Economics, UCL (since 2021)

Ph.D. in Economics, Columbia University (2016-2021)

Participated in junior hiring at UCL 2022, 2023

Co-president of European Association of Young Economists (EAYE)

Job Market Package

Job Market Paper (JMP)

Curriculum Vitae (CV)

Letters of Recommendation (LORs)

Other Documents

Website

Overview

1. Job Market Paper
2. Other Elements of JM Package
3. Managing Applications

Overview

1. Job Market Paper

- P-R-A
- Introduction
- Sections
- Abstract
- Misc

2. Other Elements of JM Package

3. Managing Applications

Job Market Paper (JMP)

Showcase research potential

Research question: creativity rewarded, e.g. fresh take on classic topic, novel topic opening a new research agenda, important implications, numerous applications

Skill: e.g. use state-of-the-art techniques, develop ingenious models/identification strategy, ability to gather data

Co-authoring

Junior co-authors unlikely to be penalized,
but avoid same paper being JMP of more than 1 person

Avoid senior co-authors, and especially advisors

JMP: P-R-A

Structure is key

Reading of papers is nonlinear

→ Help readers navigate your paper efficiently!

Recommend Varanya Chaubey's *The Little Book of Research Writing* (econscribe.org)

Starting with P-R-A

Three sentences

Placement: introduce the setting and *imply* your research question

Research Question: clear and to the point (but there will be no need to ever say it explicitly)

Answer: the one sentence punchline of what you do in the paper

(I now start every project with this)

Example 1: Empirical

Placement: The rise of social media in the beginning of the 2010s coincided with waves of political protests around the world.

Example 1: Empirical

Placement: The rise of social media in the beginning of the 2010s coincided with waves of political protests around the world.

Research Question: Did social media play any role in inducing political participation, that is, by inciting the protests, or did its content merely reflect the preferences of the population?

Example 1: Empirical

Placement: The rise of social media in the beginning of the 2010s coincided with waves of political protests around the world.

Research Question: Did social media play any role in inducing political participation, that is, by inciting the protests, or did its content merely reflect the preferences of the population?

Answer: To understand whether social media can indeed promote protest participation, we study an unexpected wave of political protests in Russia in December 2011 triggered by electoral fraud in parliamentary elections, coupled with an analysis of the effect of social media on support for the government.

Example 1: Empirical

Placement: The rise of social media in the beginning of the 2010s coincided with waves of political protests around the world.

Research Question: Did social media play any role in inducing political participation, that is, by inciting the protests, or did its content merely reflect the preferences of the population?

Answer: To understand whether social media can indeed promote protest participation, we study an unexpected wave of political protests in Russia in December 2011 triggered by electoral fraud in parliamentary elections, coupled with an analysis of the effect of social media on support for the government.

Enikolopov, Makarin, & Petrova (2020). doi: 10.3982/ECTA14281

Example 2: Theory

Placement: While existing results only guarantee stable matchings if participants' preferences are substitutable, in many important two-sided matching markets preference complementarities are pervasive.

Example 2: Theory

Placement: While existing results only guarantee stable matchings if participants' preferences are substitutable, in many important two-sided matching markets preference complementarities are pervasive.

Research Question: Can (some form of) stability be achieved in markets with preference complementarities?

Example 2: Theory

Placement: While existing results only guarantee stable matchings if participants' preferences are substitutable, in many important two-sided matching markets preference complementarities are pervasive.

Research Question: Can (some form of) stability be achieved in markets with preference complementarities?

Answer: We examine when stability can be achieved in an “asymptotic” sense by studying large markets.

Example 2: Theory

Placement: While existing results only guarantee stable matchings if participants' preferences are substitutable, in many important two-sided matching markets preference complementarities are pervasive.

Research Question: Can (some form of) stability be achieved in markets with preference complementarities?

Answer: We examine when stability can be achieved in an “asymptotic” sense by studying large markets.

Che, Kim, & Kojima (2019). doi: 10.3982/ECTA13547

JMP: Introduction

Paras 1-3 are key: **Unfolding P-R-A**

Para 1/2: Placement

Convince reader topic is important, place paper in literature, highlight gap, generate tension/interest

Research question should be obvious so as to not needing to be made explicit: it is *implied* by the placement

Para 2/3: Answer

Signposting: 'In this paper', 'This paper', 'We show', etc

JMP: Introduction

Paras 1-3 are key: **Unfolding P-R-A**

Para 1/2: Placement

Convince reader topic is important, place paper in literature, highlight gap, generate tension/interest

Research question should be obvious so as to not needing to be made explicit: it is *implied* by the placement

Para 2/3: Answer

Signposting: 'In this paper', 'This paper', 'We show', etc

Remainder of intro (paras 4-8/12): paras mimic sections/subsections

Conclude intro highlighting implications of paper, how you contribute to advancing the literature

Paragraphs

1 paragraph, 1 idea

Try: 1st sentence of paragraph summarizing the main idea it conveys

Short paragraphs (no longer than 5-6 sentences)

Signposting: First, Second, Third, Lastly, etc

Avoid making reader dizzy with multiple turns (A, but B, leads to C, however D)

JMP: Introduction

1st sentence of paras

Empirical: Enikolopov, Makarin, & Petrova (2020). doi: 10.3982/ECTA14281

Para 1: Collective action problem has traditionally been seen as one of the major barriers to achieving socially beneficial outcomes (e.g., Olson (1965), Hardin (1982), Ostrom (1990)).

Para 2: The rise of social media in the beginning of the 2010s coincided with waves of political protests around the world.

Para 3: To understand whether social media can indeed promote protest participation, we study an unexpected wave of political protests in Russia in December 2011 triggered by electoral fraud in parliamentary elections, coupled with an analysis of the effect of social media on support for the government.

(...)

JMP: Introduction

1st sentence of paras

Experimental: Abeler, Nosenzo, & Raymond (2019). doi: 10.3982/ECTA14673

Para 1: Reporting private information is at the heart of many economic activities, for example, a self-employed shopkeeper reporting her income to the tax authorities (e.g., Allingham and Sandmo (1972)), a doctor stating a diagnosis (e.g., Ma and McGuire (1997)), or an expert giving advice (e.g., Crawford and Sobel (1982)).

Para 2: Until recently, the assumption of always submitting the payoff-maximizing report has gone basically untested, partly because empirically studying reporting behavior is by definition difficult.

Para 3: In this paper, we aim to deepen our understanding of how people report private information.

(...)

JMP: Introduction

Useless corset for theory? Not really!

Theory: Che, Kim, & Kojima (2019). doi: 10.3982/ECTA13547

Para 1: Since the celebrated work by Gale and Shapley (1962), matching theory has emerged as a central tool for analyzing the design of matching markets. (what's stability, why it matters)

Para 2: Unfortunately, a stable matching exists only under restrictive conditions. (explains issues and discusses real-life cases that illustrate the gap)

Para 3: This paper takes a step forward in accommodating preference complementarities and other forms of general preferences. (discusses general approach and main result)

(...)

You can read 1st sentence of each para and get a good idea of the whole paper!

JMP: Introduction

General comments

Favor short intros (4-5 pp.)

Separate Related literature section? No consensus (I like it separate)

Polish intro: dozens of iterations, lengthy process

Get feedback from advisors, faculty, peers

JMP: Sections

Theory: Intro, Setting/Framework, Result 1, Result 2, Result 3,
Extensions/Discussion/Conclusion, Appendix

Experimental: Intro, Setting/Framework/Hypotheses, Experimental Design,
Methodology/Identification, Result 1, Result 2, Result 3,
Robustness/Discussion/Conclusion, Appendix

Empirical: Intro, (Setting/Framework,) Background, Data, Methodology/Identification,
Result 1, Result 2, Result 3, Robustness/Discussion/Conclusion, Appendix

Some variations in empirical/experimental papers: theory before/after
design/background

Paras in intro typically mimick order of sections/subsections of the paper

Discussion/Conclusion: robustness of results, contribution (also last para in intro)

JMP: Abstract

Extended version of P-R-A

keep it short; e.g. between 100 words (AER) and 150 words (Ecta)

1: placement (1-2 sentences)

2: what the paper does (1-2 sentences)

3: most important findings, and potential implications (1-3 sentences)

JMP: Miscellaneous

Keep it updated: link to most recent version

Formatting: check Ecta's and JEEA's style guidelines

exception: JMP *can be* on the longer side, 40-50 pp. (with main tables/figs) plus appendix (but doesn't need to)

References: link to return to page (hyperref with backref=page option)

Paper \neq set theorems/tables

Explain your results, e.g. intuition for proofs/mechanisms

Paper \neq research diary

Title: Topic should be easy to infer from title

Overview

1. Job Market Paper

2. Other Elements of JM Package

- Curriculum Vitae (CV)
- Letters of Recommendation (LORs)
- Cover Letters
- Other Documents
- Website
- Signals

3. Managing Applications

Curriculum Vitae (CV)

Don't innovate! Check other candidates' cv

What to list

- Education
- Research output (with abstract); JMP first
- Areas of interest
- Teaching experience
- Professional experience (only if relevant)
- Awards, grants
- Names of references
- Contact information

Letters of Recommendation (LORs)

3 LORs is standard, but sometimes 4 are asked
(only add 4th if asked for/if extremely relevant)

Inform letter writers where you are applying to and your preferences

Choosing letter writers:

Your advisor(s) and faculty with whom you have some close enough link,
possibly committee members

Check their placement record, get info about style, experience in writing
letters/hiring

Cover Letters

Customize 2-3 sentences in letter (besides address)

Recruiters will look for marks signaling your interest (this is actually true)

Mention ties to country/city/university

Naming faculty members (possibly risky), Mention institution's strengths that are relevant to you

Cover letter is 1 pp., not more

Other Documents

Other papers: add if asked; if not required, only add strong papers

Only submit documents if *required* and respect space limits

Teaching Statement: 1-2 pp. with teaching philosophy (some top depts do read it)

Research Statement: 1-3 pp. (depends). Summarize research output, link it into coherent whole, explain research agenda

Diversity Statement: actions taken to improve diversity, innate characteristics

Teaching Evaluations: submit only if required

Video presentation: I would not do it (personal opinion) unless you are a fantastic video producer

Website

List: position/institution and research focus, papers with abstracts (and links to pdf), contact (email), cv

Where: github pages, google websites

Custom domain: a matter of personal preference

Avoid dropbox or google drive to store documents (github pages doesn't have this issue)

It takes some time, so plan accordingly

Do it nice, but do NOT innovate; don't overdo it

(personal recommendation: the winning combo github + github pages + vscode)

Signals

AEA allows you to send signals to 2 employers, reaffirming your interest (even if employer advertises elsewhere)

Use them for schools you'd really like to work for and you think they may invite you otherwise e.g.

Low-ranked departments who might think that you're too good

Departments who are in doubt if you're good enough for them

Don't waste a signal on employers that will (not) invite you anyway or that you would not like to work for

(Unclear how effective these are)

Timeline

A conservative approach

- Jul-Aug: have all your results
- late Aug – early Sept: finish 1st draft
- Sept: iterate on draft, prep talk, meet advisor(s), get lots of feedback
- Oct: polish, polish, polish (JMP, JM Talk), have application marathon started – beware of early deadlines
- Nov: prep for application frenzy, work on spiel, get lots of feedback
- Dec: polish/practice spiel and interviews ALL THE TIME, 1st round interviews, practice JM talk
- Jan: 2nd round interviews, practice JM talk in-between (chaotic and stressful period)

Applying

Deadlines vary! Not all institutions have the same

Platforms:

EJM <https://econjobmarket.org>

JOE <https://www.aeaweb.org/joe/listings>

AJO <https://academicjobsonline.org/ajo>

Interfolio <https://account.interfolio.com>

SSRN <https://www.ssrn.com/index.cfm/en/janda/job-openings>

HEJ <https://www.higheredjobs.com/faculty/search.cfm>

Keep organized. Suggestion

Spreadsheet for listings: University/Dept, Position, Deadline, Other docs required,
Nr Letters, Link1, Link2, Application Submitted?, LOR Submitted?, Interview date

Keep track of last date you checked each platform and sort by date

Filters are your friends: location, field

Non-Academic Placement

Many places in the industry have very similar application systems
e.g. require JMP

Contact past graduates in industry

Networks matter

The Job Market Package

Duarte Gonçalves

UCL

EEA/ESEM

Barcelona School of Economics

1 September 2023

Overview

4. Interviews

- Spiel
- Questions

Spiel

Spiel (15min): the onion structure

P-R-A all over again

1. Greetings and introductions (20-30secs)
2. Elevator pitch (1-2min): PRA
3. Summary (3-5min): Motivation, Model/Design/Identification, Results

1+2+3 \approx 5-8min

4. Details: have up to 10min content prepared

Do pause semi-frequently, not too long, just enough to allow for questions/comments

5. Conclusion (30sec-1min): punchline/main takeaway

Leave time for interviewers to intervene, but if they don't keep on going

- * Other papers: onion structure with mini-spiel (30sec-1min) + details (additional 1-2min); for every single one of the other papers you have
- * Research agenda (3-5min): current pipeline (30sec-1min mini-spiels for 2-3 papers), what you'd like to do, how everything is connected

DO NOT READ and it should not feel like you're just repeating memorized text neither; this is your research, you know it better than anyone!

Questions

Questions about your work

Write down every single question you have been/can be asked for every one of your papers

... and have a quick answer for it (it may be, in a few cases, 'I don't know')

e.g. How does your work connect to real life?

What are the policy implications of your paper(s)?

Why is this economics? Why is it an interesting topic?

Questions to elicit information:

Which classes would you be willing to teach? Which textbooks/papers would you use/teach?

If given the possibility to choose, which course(s) would you teach? What would it be a rough syllabus of this course?

What is the best recent paper you have read and why? (please don't say yours/mine)

If you had to invite three people for a seminar, whom would you invite?

Questions

Questions to elicit interest:

Why are you interested in coming here? Do you think you'd be happy in a department like ours?

Which contribution would you expect to give to this department?

If here, who are the people you expect to interact with?

“Do you have any question for us?”

The answer is usually no, but this is your moment to shine and show that you did your homework (in about 30sec)

Learn about the dept before interviews: faculty, people who would be rooting for you, location, interviewers (ask), seminars relevant for you, conferences/workshops, existence of lab/research center, etc